

**OSHTEMO CHARTER TOWNSHIP
PLANNING COMMISSION**

MINUTES OF A MEETING HELD DECEMBER 12, 2013

Agenda

SPECIAL EXCEPTION USE AND SITE PLAN REVIEW OF THE APPLICATION OF MANGIA PIZZA & PASTA COMPANY FOR A TEMPORARY OUTDOOR EVENT TO INCLUDE A FARMER'S MARKET TO BE HELD ON SATURDAY AND SUNDAY MORNINGS FROM MAY TO OCTOBER, 2014 AT THEIR PROPERTY LOCATED AT 3112 SOUTH 9TH STREET IN THE VC VILLAGE COMMERCIAL DISTRICT (PARCEL #3905-26-380-048 AND #3905-26-380-080

SPECIAL EXCEPTION USE AND SITE PLAN REVIEW OF THE APPLICATION OF COSTCO WHOLESALE CORPORATION FOR A 149,505 SQUARE FOOT RETAIL STORE AND FREE-STANDING, ACCESSORY FUEL STATION LOCATED ON A PROPOSED 16.29 ACRE PARCEL WITHIN A LARGER 39.25 ACRE PROPOSED COMMERCIAL DEVELOPMENT IN THE C-LOCAL BUSINESS DISTRICT AT THE NORTHWEST CORNER OF DRAKE ROAD AND STADIUM DRIVE.

A meeting of the Oshtemo Charter Township Planning Commission was held on Thursday, December 12, 2013, commencing at approximately 7:00 p.m. at the Oshtemo Charter Township Hall.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Kitty Gelling, Chairperson
 Fred Antosz
 Wiley Boulding Sr.
 Dusty Farmer
 Millard Loy
 Terry Schley
 Richard Skalski

MEMBERS ABSENT: None

Also present were Greg Milliken, Planning Director; James Porter, Attorney; Marc Elliott, Engineer; Martha Coash, Meeting Transcriptionist; and approximately twenty five (25) interested persons.

Call to Order and Pledge of Allegiance

Chairperson Gelling called the meeting to order at approximately 7:00 p.m. and the "Pledge of Allegiance" was recited. The Chairperson thanked the attendees for their interest.

Agenda

The Chairperson asked for a motion to approve the agenda.

Mr. Schley made a motion to accept the agenda as presented. Mr. Skalski seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items

Chairperson Gelling called for public comment on non-agenda items. Hearing none, she proceeded to the next agenda item.

Approval of the Minutes of November 14, 2013

The Chairperson asked if there were any additions, deletions or corrections to the minutes of November 14, 2013. Hearing none, she asked for motion to approve the minutes.

Mr. Skalski made a motion to approve the minutes. Mr. Boulding Sr. seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

Special Exception Use and Site Plan Review of the application of Mangia Pizza & Pasta Company for a temporary outdoor event to include a farmer's market to be held on Saturday and Sunday mornings from May to October, 2014 at their property located at 3112 South 9th Street in the VC Village Commercial District (parcels #3905-26-380-048 and #3905-26-380-080)

Chairperson Gelling said the next item on the agenda was a public hearing to consider the application for a special exception use and site plan review of the application of Mangia Pizza & Pasta company for a temporary outdoor event to include a farmer's market to be held on Saturday and Sunday mornings from May to October, 2014 at their property located at 3112 South 9th Street in the VC Village Commercial District. She reminded the Commission that this item had been included on the November agenda, but Mangia Pizza and Pasta Company had asked that their application be considered at a later date and the Commission tabled it to this meeting.

She noted the board heard public comments on this item at the November meeting. She asked Mr. Milliken to please expand on this application.

Mr. Milliken noted this is a continued public hearing and that there had been some concerns raised by adjacent neighbors at last month's meeting. He noted the location of the restaurant and parking lot where the proposed farmer's market would be located. The farmer's market would be open from Memorial Day weekend through Labor Day weekend, or approximately 28 days, a reduction in the schedule from the original application. The hours proposed were 9 – 1:30 on Saturday and 10 – 1:30 on Sunday. 38 booths would be located in the rear portion of the parking lot. The majority of the vendors would be food vendors, there would be some entertainment and they would serve lunch, utilizing the outdoor seating area. The booths would occupy 36 parking spaces, leaving about 50 parking spaces in the Mangia lot for parking during the market hours. The parking lot continues to the north and is adjacent to and owned by the Birches facility. He noted the applicant was in attendance.

Mr. Milliken said the Commission's review and consideration of this application is based on the standard in the zoning ordinance for a special exception use, which addressed concerns like compatibility, impact, health, safety and welfare. He added that at the time the staff report was written there was not much guidance available as to what the impacts could be since they don't know how many vendors would participate initially or how many people would be coming to the market.

He said Texas Township was contacted regarding their farmer's market and their experience. Their market director indicated that on Saturdays about 35 vendors participate and they average about 2200 adult shoppers, peaking at 3000 in July, not including children. They have roughly 45 parking spaces with an additional grassy area for overflow parking. There are agreements with area businesses for use of their parking lots. The market is open Saturdays, from mid-May to mid-October, and they also host some special events and Tuesday markets. They recommended coordination with the Michigan Farmer's Market Association.

Mr. Milliken concluded by saying there is no doubt there is a demand for a farmer's market in this area and it would be an asset for the village area. He said the question for Commissioners to consider is whether this is the appropriate location and the appropriate parameters for operation.

Mr. Schley noted by his calculation there likely could be about 625 visitors an hour to the market based on the 2,500 visitors estimate provided by Texas Township. In response to his question about whether there was a more substantive analysis of parking requirements and capacity, Mr. Milliken replied there was not.

Mr. Milliken also indicated a variety of correspondence regarding this application had been received and provided to Commissioners.

Mr. Antosz asked whether there were legal issues with the driveway easement.

Mr. Milliken replied he had not reviewed the easement.

Chairperson Gelling asked the applicant to please address the Board.

Mr. Emilio Dacoba, 9763 Springwood Drive, and owner of Mangia Pizza and Pasta Restaurant, said he was there to ask the Planning Commission to approve the special use permit for a farmer's market, which he said he felt would be a great addition to the DDA and that this would help to bring more people to the area and expose them to the good things coming to the downtown Oshtemo area; they hope the farmer's market will augment that plan. They want to be a good neighbor and think the market will be a boon to the area and that everyone will prosper.

Chairperson Gelling asked Mr. Dacoba whether he had produced an easement for the driveway.

Mr. Dacoba said he has an easement for the commercial property that allows ingress and egress for his customers; it does not have a limit for numbers or types of vehicles.

The Chairperson asked if he had done a professional traffic or parking study for the proposed use.

Mr. Dacoba said he had not done a study.

Chairperson Gelling asked whether he had talked with Hardings officials regarding possible overflow of traffic from the market.

Mr. Dacoba said he had not talked with Hardings and stated he is the traffic "cop" for his parking lot. He talked with Mr. VanGorp, owner of the Birches, who is worried about farmer's market customers parking in the Birches lot, but said they have an understanding. He said they were good neighbors and would work together to make the whole area better.

The Chairperson asked about parking for vendors.

Mr. Dacoba said there is a large grassy area where they can park and those in the center could park next to their tents.

Chairperson Gelling asked if he had talked with the Kalamazoo County Health Department regarding regulations for food vendors and to utilize their expertise for such an operation.

Mr. Dacoba explained he has not talked with them but that they have a good, close relationship with the Health Department and will have no problem contacting

them. The Dept. of Agriculture will also be involved. They regulate the vendors' businesses that are pre-certified to sell their wares. He said he would contact them.

Chairperson Gelling pointed out she would have thought that would have been done prior to the meeting so that he would have more information for the Board.

Mr. Dacoba said that he would be addressing these issues in stage two after the Board approved the market. He did not want to waste anyone's time if the use does not get approved.

The Chairperson asked about what entertainment he had in mind for the market.

Mr. Dacoba explained it would be something to set a convivial mood, similar to the concertina player at the Texas Township market.

Chairperson Gelling asked Mr. Dacoba to clarify the statement in his application about this being a for-profit venture.

Mr. Dacoba replied that he operates a business and must make a profit by collecting booth fees. If the market does not prove to be profitable it would be terminated. It is the same way any public market operates.

Mr. Loy asked why Sunday hours were included.

Mr. Dacoba said he was trying to broaden the opportunity for making the products available allowing more flexibility for customers and vendors.

Mr. Skalski stated he likes the concept of a farmer's market and that it supports the DDA goal. He asked if the application is approved and problems were to develop with parking, trespassing or noise, whether accommodations could be made in the business model to address them.

Mr. Dacoba replied that would absolutely be the case. He would install signage and would have someone patrolling the lot, but the apartment complex would need to be proactive too. If he has an agreement with an adjacent business he would remove cars. Issues would be addressed as they come up, but he would try to curtail them as much as possible.

Chairperson Gelling asked if he saw a potential liability to the community with people crossing the street if there is overflow parking there.

Mr. Dacoba said he didn't think parking would spill over into the Hardings lot – it will take time to grow before that might occur, but if someone really wants to cross five lanes of traffic, it would be their fault if they were hit. There is a crosswalk signal that should be used and obeyed. He said there are a lot of variables that will be addressed as they come up.

The Chairperson asked if he had talked to anyone at the neighboring Oshtemo Methodist Church, which holds services on Sunday.

Mr. Dacoba replied that he had not.

Mr. Boulding Sr. asked what was planned regarding restroom facilities.

Mr. Dacoba explained the restaurant has facilities rated for over 300 people that will be available; the restaurant would not be open at that time except for patio service.

Chairperson Gelling asked if Mr. Dacoba had contacted the Michigan Farmers Market Association, which oversees over 300 farmer's markets.

Mr. Dacoba said he had done research on their website, and that when it was appropriate, he would engage all the appropriate agencies.

Mr. Loy asked about the timeliness of tent removal.

Mr. Dacoba indicated all tents would be removed right away so the parking lot is available for the restaurant opening at 4:00 p.m.

Ms. Farmer asked if there would be signage indicating whether a vendor is a grower or a seller and whether their products are organic, and she also wondered whether they would have their own insurance.

Mr. Dacoba said there would be signage, and he indicated the focus would be on local producers. They want to promote local farmers and the local economy. Vendors selling organic products would need to display the appropriate certificate, and they would be required to have their own insurance.

Mr. Skalski asked about food preparation licensing.

Mr. Dacoba replied food preparation must be licensed and it is the responsibility of the preparer to secure the license.

Mr. Skalski asked if portable restroom facilities would be utilized if the restaurant facilities could not handle the volume of traffic generated.

Mr. Dacoba said if needed they would be rented and removed promptly.

Ms. Farmer asked if he had an agreement with the owner of the Birches.

Mr. Dacoba said they have an understanding, not an agreement. He said he'd do everything he could to keep vehicles out of the adjacent parking lot, towing them if necessary.

Mr. Loy noted that with the figures provided, it would mean about 175 cars an hour coming to the market and he felt that parking was a serious issue.

Mr. Dacoba repeated his belief that it would take some time to reach that amount of traffic and that growth would be managed.

Chairperson Gelling asked if this would be a marketing tool conducted on a for profit basis, whether he had considered any other locations for the market, and whether he had a "plan B" for parking.

Mr. Dacoba said that it would be a profit based venture, he had not considered any other location, and that he did not have a parking "plan B".

The Chairperson asked if there is a back-up plan for parking once all places are taken.

Mr. Dacoba said he thinks people will leave if there is no place to park. If needed, he could decrease the number of vendor booths.

There were no further questions from the Board and the Chairperson asked for public comment.

Mr. Richard VanGorp, 3326 East Shore Drive, Portage and owner of The Birches, stated he is against opening a farmer's market at the Mangia restaurant because there is no place for overflow parking except on the Birches parking lot. He has to protect his parking to successfully run his business. He said he is not against a farmer's market, but said it should be at a different location.

Attorney Jeff Swenerton, of Kreis, Enderle, Hudgins and Borsos P.C., spoke to the Board on behalf of Campbell Caron Properties, owner of Mill Creek Apartments, located to the south and west of the Mangia Restaurant. He said their objection is not about the Dacobas or their restaurant, or farmer's markets, or Oshtemo Township. It is about the Ordinance and location. No one will want to move into an apartment complex that is 100 feet from where market booths will be set up every Saturday and Sunday throughout the summer. There will be real noise and parking issues for residents. He said there is no written easement for parking and no traffic study. Hardings doesn't want a farmer's market in that location, and safety issues are involved. He cited the many issues discussed previously in the meeting. He added that Mr. Dacoba "does not have his ducks in a row." He noted customers of Texas Township's farmer's market park at adjacent businesses with which there are agreements. He urged the Commissioners to deny the application because it is not the right location for a farmer's market.

Mr. Brian Maloney, 3062 S. 9th Street, is a co-owner of the building condominium with Mr. VanGorp; 12 of the parking spots in front of the building are reserved for his use. He said he was in concurrence with Mr. VanGorp. He said he doesn't want his 12

spots used for anyone other than his customers or a business within the condo association. He was not opposed to a farmer's market, but based on what has been presented, believes there will be problems in this location. He received information from Texas Township showing when they began they had 36 vendors and 1200 customers on the first day. People use several nearby parking lots and cross roads to get to the market. Sheriff's Department personnel are present to keep their customers safe. With a similar size market to Texas Township, he did not see how they could accommodate the number of vehicles that will need to park.

Mr. Themis Corakis, 7018 West M Avenue, and owner of two parcels across the street from the restaurant, at 6400 and 64156 Stadium Drive, said he likes farmer's markets, but opposes this location on the basis of parking. He said he talked to both the manager and assistant manager of Harding's and that they also are against the application.

Mr. Matt Weaver, 5920 W. Emberley Avenue in Portage, and representing Mill Creek Apartments, said he spoke three times with Harding's officials, who are concerned about parking and potential liability. They stated that under no circumstances is their parking lot available for overflow parking from a farmer's market. Mr. Dacoba stated the apartment complex needed to be proactive, which means at the complex's expense, including on call staff to police parking and noise complaints. He believes this would be injurious to their business, which is a key consideration of the township ordinance. They would be supporting Mr. Dacoba's profit making operation with their resources. Even if there was only one third of the turnout that is typical at the Texas Township market, that is still a tremendous amount of traffic and people and will be injurious to the surrounding property owners and their non-shared parking lots.

Ms. Rebecca Steele owns property in Texas and Oshtemo Townships and has been a vendor selling cookies at the Texas Township farmer's market for five years. She supported this project and pointed out that farmer's market shoppers are your neighbors and friends and are also shoppers, and will shop at establishments in the business district. Farmer's market shoppers tend to be thoughtful and courteous. She indicated she would love to be a part of a market in Oshtemo.

Ms. Christine Ellis, a resident of Mill Creek Apartments, 66728 Mill Creek Drive, noted there are no parking passes or stickers for residents, nor is there assigned parking and wondered how anyone policing the lot would know her car and not inadvertently tow it when there was a problem. She said it took her almost four minutes to turn left from the complex onto 9th street at lunch time that day and felt it would be much more difficult with a farmer's market there on the weekends. She added she is concerned about noise, parking, congestion and her children's safety from trespassers. She felt a farmer's market in another location, perhaps Flesher Field, would be appropriate.

Mr. Brian Wood, resident of Mill Creek Apartments, stated the last thing he wants is not to have a place to park after church on Sunday. He concurred with Ms. Ellis'

comments. He supports business and farmer's markets, but felt the plan before the Commission is shaky at best, and it would need more study before he could support it.

Mr. Grant Taylor, 2928 Sunset, (behind Harding's) told the Commission he supports having a farmer's market that is within walking distance of his home. Having a market would be a great opportunity for neighborhood and area residents and the spillover business from market shoppers would also be an opportunity for Harding's.

Mr. James Noel, 3538 N. 3rd Street, operator of AM Supply, 5190 W. Michigan Ave., wondered how fire trucks would be able to enter the parking lot full of tents. He noted Texas Township has a fire truck "planted" at their farmer's market. He said he foresees that being a big issue.

Hearing no further public comments, Chairperson Gelling closed the public hearing and moved to Board Deliberations.

Attorney Porter indicated deliberations should be conducted according to Ordinance Standards.

Mr. Schley provided a comprehensive evaluation of the intent of the application pertaining to the Ordinance Standards related to temporary outdoor events and retail/mercantile, (Section 33.312 VC) the Form Based Code, Section 34.000, and Section 60. He concluded that in the "Village Core", Oshtemo has a very specifically defined environment, and if this use as presented were to be considered, the Planning Commission would have to look at the ordinance for change and consider the implications to its' understanding of the VC District, the Form Based Code, and the Oshtemo Master Plan as to what this for future outcomes.

He added the Planning Commission should also want a deeper consideration for how this may undermine the expectations to which the Planning Commission holds other businesses. Consideration should be given to the fact that this proposal is on private property, not a public place, with first benefit intended for success of a private business which here could effectively run a mini retail center during summer weekends, to lesser standards than Oshtemo holds other businesses.

He said approval would undermine the ability of the Commission to ask others to conform to the Form Based Code. The Ordinance does not easily recognize proportional use. The Planning Commission denied an application in the recent past for a portable BBQ wagon at a restaurant at the corner of Parkview and Stadium as an accessory building. The plan does not meet Ordinance parking standards. First priority is context – there must be a fit within the district, or what the Planning Commission does must be defended by Ordinance. This proposal falls short by Ordinance and does not fit.

Mr. Schley concluded by saying that although the idea is exciting and difficult to quash, it would be a mistake for the Planning Commission to set a bad precedent for the future by approving it. He complimented the initiative of the applicant and hopes

whatever the outcome, that they might be able to continue to work on the initiative of a farmer's market to enhance economic development in the Township.

Mr. Loy stated that parking is lacking in the proposal and noted how parking is handled at the Texas Township and Kalamazoo farmer's markets. He was also concerned about the ability of fire trucks to access the area, noise issues for the adjacent apartment complex residents, and he opposed operation of a market on Sundays. He agreed with Mr. Schley's comments and explained he supports farmer's markets wholeheartedly, but not in this location.

Mr. Boulding Sr. said he thinks it is a great idea to have a farmer's market in the community. He listened carefully to the citizens who spoke and noted eight of 10 were opposed to this location. The proposal does not meet the Ordinance requirements and there are a lot of unanswered questions and unknowns. He was unable to support the proposal until they are solved or resolved. He appreciated the large turnout of citizens and noted those who supported the proposal are not directly affected and those who are directly affected were strongly opposed to negative effects on their lifestyle.

Mr. Skalski said he sees the value to the community in having a farmer's market and felt the biggest issue with the proposal is parking. If unable to reach an agreement he would like to see something worked out to be able to have a market in the area in the future.

Chairperson Gelling indicated the proposal infringes on the Ordinance for many reasons. Parking is a problem. She said there are too many variables present: sources not contacted, liability, disturbance, too much profit for the individual rather than for the good of the community, too many people inconvenienced, and said she was inclined to oppose the proposal.

Mr. Antosz commented having a farmer's market in the Village Commercial District is a fantastic idea, but felt Flesher Field would be a more appropriate location. Parking is a strong issue and he was disappointed there were no commitments presented regarding the parking lot agreement. A market would be a good way to promote businesses in the area. Maybe in the future the DDA could be a partner. He said he could not support the proposal as it stands currently.

Ms. Farmer said a farmer's market would be a fantastic benefit to the community. There is good evidence that when farmers markets go in, crime rates go down and healthy eating habits increase. She said she looks forward to the time when Oshtemo Township has a farmer's market, but this proposal does not satisfy the requirements of the Ordinance.

Chairperson Gelling asked for a motion on the farmer's market application.

Mr. Schley made a motion to deny the special exception request from the Mangia Pizza and Pasta Company for a farmer's market located on their property. Mr. Loy seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

Special Exception Use and Site Plan Review of the application of Costco Wholesale Corporation for a 149,505 square foot retail store and free-standing, accessory fueling station located on a proposed 16.29 acre parcel within a larger 39.25 acre proposed commercial development in the C-Local Business District at the northwest corner of Drake Road and Stadium Drive.

After a short break, Chairperson Gelling said the next item on the agenda was a public hearing to consider the application for a special exception use and site plan review for Costco for a 149,505 square foot retail store and free-standing, accessory fueling station located on a proposed 16.29 acre parcel within a larger 39.25 acre proposed commercial development in the C-Local Business District at the northwest corner of Drake Road and Stadium Drive. She asked Mr. Milliken to please review the application.

Mr. Milliken told the board the applicant desires to develop a 148,000 square foot retail store (Costco) on 16.29 acres within a larger 39.25 acre development area, all of which is located within the C – Local Business District. The development area is located at the northwest corner of Stadium Drive and Drake Road and is also bounded by US-131 and West Michigan Avenue. Also included in the request is development of a gas station (Costco), which is a special exception use in the C district. He noted Commissioners have extensive packets of information so he would not go through everything, but would try to be as succinct as possible and would answer questions afterwards.

The development area occupies the better part of what has been referred to as the Century Highfield Sub Area by the Township in previous planning exercises. These exercises have called for the area to be used for commercial purposes for over 20 years. In October 2013, the Township Board approved the rezoning of the property from R-2 and R-3 residential to C commercial, consistent with the Master Plan and Sub-Area Plan.

Mr. Milliken indicated that in 2014, MDOT will replace the Stadium / 131 interchange, and in conjunction with that project complete significant improvements to the Drake Road / Stadium Drive intersection. The project significantly increases the capacity of these roads and intersection to accommodate the high volume of existing traffic and potential traffic that could be generated from adjacent properties. In addition, drainage and non-motorized improvements are also included. Improvements will address traffic flow congestion. The improvements were designed to accommodate development 30 years into the future.

Mr. Milliken pointed out tree clearing and demolition work has already begun along the Drake Road frontage. This initial work – 300 feet deep from Drake Road – is

required as a result of the MDOT project and the expansion of Drake Road. Regardless of whether or not the subject property is developed or this application is approved, that work was going to occur due to the pending road project.

He said if the application is approved, that work would extend across the entire site. To prepare the site to accommodate the proposed retail development, the required access road, and future out lot development, the trees will be removed, homes demolished (or relocated), and the site balanced.

Mr. Milliken explained the existing public roads within the development area are proposed to be vacated. In their place, the developer proposes a service drive with access points onto Drake Road and West Michigan Avenue that would serve both the Costco site as well as the future out lot development. The service drive is located within an easement area and would be privately maintained by an association created within the development.

He said the Drake Road access point is north of the existing intersection of Drake Road and Century Drive. The developer has coordinated with the owners of the property to the east (former K-Mart), and the two existing driveways on the east side of the road will be consolidated into one and align with the proposed access road. A traffic signal is also proposed.

Mr. Milliken noted the location of this access point and intersection, the lane alignment on Drake Road, and the requirement for the traffic signal has been well studied and evaluated by a variety of different agencies and engineers. The applicant has submitted a traffic study to support the request and document that the proposed development will not negatively impact Drake Road. This has been reviewed carefully by MDOT and the City of Kalamazoo (who maintains Drake Road in this location). These agencies as well as the Township and the developer have been engaged in the design process related to the MDOT improvements for well over a year. Incorporation of this project and required circulation improvements into the design has been a part of those discussions to ensure the function of the desired circulation improvements on Stadium Drive and Drake Road are maintained, and all agencies are satisfied that they are. In addition, Costco has carefully reviewed the proposed circulation system along with the changes being made by MDOT for they do not want to locate at a site where their members do not have safe, efficient access. Thus, their comfort with the proposed access on Drake Road is important to note.

In addition, Mr. Milliken said, there has been ongoing discussion between the applicant and the Road Commission regarding potential improvements required to West Michigan Avenue as a result of the proposed development including enhanced shoulders, drainage swales, and a left turn lane into the development. However, not enough information or analysis is available to make a determination about West Michigan Avenue or to assess what if any improvements are necessary to mitigate the impacts of the proposed development. He recommended any approval be conditioned on coordination between the Township, developer, and Road Commission regarding the

evaluation of potential impacts to West Michigan Avenue and appropriate resulting mitigation strategies, if warranted.

Mr. Milliken indicated a major component of the overall development is a significant retaining wall and landscaping at the immediate corner of Stadium Drive and Drake Road. This retaining wall is necessary to support the grading required by the MDOT improvements and will be constructed of natural looking, stacked stones. It would be well landscaped and create a defining element of the development. Similar materials would be incorporated into building architecture as well as retaining walls along West Michigan Avenue and US-131 although specific details on these facilities, such as location, height, and length, are not finalized at this time. These details will need to be confirmed with staff prior to installation.

He said from a utility aspect, the biggest issue is stormwater and that Township Engineer, Marc Elliott had reviewed the proposed stormwater system and provided feedback and comments. The Costco stormwater is designed to be maintained on site and will be sent to a detention basin constructed north of the proposed building site and adjacent to West Michigan Avenue. The basin will be anywhere from 10 to 30 feet deep.

Mr. Milliken noted the out lot areas in the southwestern portion of the site will drain to the basins being constructed as part of the new interchange. These basins were built to accommodate the water that naturally flowed into the interchange from the property based on the current topography and therefore can accept this water. Along Drake Road, the City of Kalamazoo has agreed to accept pre-treated stormwater from the out lots in this area into an existing stormwater pipe that flows into Asylum Lake.

Mr. Milliken referred to Sheet C200 that presented the site plan layout for the Costco parcel. The gas station is located in the southern portion of the lot to serve customers as they enter the property. While efficient and well oriented for circulation and access purposes, this does put the facility out front and in plain view immediately upon entry to the development from Drake Road. The gas station is designed to be an unmanned facility with eight pump stations located under a 4,000 square foot canopy. A small kiosk is provided for operations adjacent to the canopy. Additional screening, including a variety of species providing all-season screening and screening at different heights, has been provided along the service drive adjacent to the fueling station to address aesthetic concerns and impacts from the facility.

Mr. Milliken pointed out there are a total of 724 parking spaces provided. He explained the orientation of the building and said it will function as a four-sided building. The loading docks are placed in the northwest corner of the building, which is technically considered a front yard due to its location vis a vis West Michigan Avenue. A variance has already been requested from the ZBA. Extensive landscaping is planned there for screening.

Mr. Milliken noted three different landscaping plans were provided. Two demonstrate landscape details for the overall development, while the third plan shows

the Costco landscaping. Most of this is proposed to be installed as part of this project. However, landscaping along the perimeter of the out lot sites will be installed as part of out lot development. The plans also illustrate entry feature landscaping and elements at Drake Road and West Michigan. He walked through the two overall plans with Commissioners and described how the overall plan will tie all elements together to blend the development as one.

Mr. Milliken then walked through the Costco landscaping plan. He indicated that along West Michigan Avenue, the applicant has substituted evergreen trees for some of the requested materials, and he encouraged the Planning Commission to approve this Plan due to the more complete screening provided as a result, along the detention basins and service area. The staff report indicated the plan was short on parking lot landscaping and trees. The applicant has submitted a revised plan that appears to conform to this requirement. Mr. Milliken noted the walls that will tie in with the architectural features and unify the project around the perimeter of the site.

He said the lighting proposed satisfies the Ordinance requirement, making sure light doesn't spread out over West Michigan or to property owners on the north side. There is a variance request for the wattage of the light bulbs in the parking lot on the agenda this month for the Zoning Board of Appeals.

In conclusion, Mr. Milliken explained the Commission had two items for review: a site plan review and a special exception use as a result of the inclusion of a gas station. He recommended the Board utilize two motions and noted he had included criteria for approval in his review memo. He noted there is a lot of information to consider and still some details to sort out but nothing unusual given a project of this size and staff is comfortable they can be addressed as the applicant moves forward.

Chairperson Gelling asked if Commissioners had any questions for Mr. Milliken.

Mr. Antosz wondered if there will be documentation and certification that the septic tanks and wells are shut down properly.

Mr. Milliken replied that there would be appropriate documentation and certification.

In answer to a question from Mr. Antosz about the definition of pre-treated storm water, Mr. Elliott explained the process applicable to the site, which is within the wellhead protection zone established by the city for their public water system. In this case there will likely be a structure, such as a vault, that provides some dynamic separation of floatables and settling particles. Hydrocarbons will be removed through use of carbon bags that will also intercept the flow. He indicated the water would flow within a pipe, or swale, and that overgrowing vegetation slows the speed and encourages settlement of particles.

Mr. Antosz asked if all of Mr. Elliott's concerns would be addressed to his satisfaction.

Mr. Elliott replied he believed his concerns would be addressed as final engineering plans are developed and that he would be involved in the process to assure that they are.

Mr. Antosz asked if the retention pond would be fenced.

Mr. Elliott explained that is not a Township requirement. He stated that the proposed pond is not an uncommon design and meets current standards and practice.

Mr. Schley asked about the requirement for a 200 square foot parking space to overlap sidewalks.

Mr. Milliken said that where the spaces are 18 feet deep, spaces are adjacent to lawn areas where vehicles pull up against curb areas at least 2 feet at the front of the vehicle hanging over the landscape area.

Mr. Schley asked if a 20 foot buffer was required, would this allow a five foot overlap or reduction in the green space area.

Mr. Milliken replied that when one pulls up to the curb, the front of the car hangs over 36 – 48", and he is comfortable with that considering this part of the required parking space as it results in less paved surface.

Mr. Schley also had questions about the 11 foot high retaining walls on Michigan Avenue regarding safety issues/building permits.

Mr. Milliken said he did not believe others who built similar walls were required to get building permits but would need to confirm. He was sure the Zoning Ordinance did not require a fence or barrier. He doesn't think the safety code or any zoning ordinance would apply.

Mr. Schley said he understands there is a 300 foot tree clearing required by MDOT at Stadium Drive and Drake Road, but it appears there has been much more clearance than that to date and he was concerned about that process.

Mr. Milliken said his understanding is that the clearing has been limited to 300 feet. There has been some geo-technical work done that has involved some drilling and bulldozing, necessary to obtain samples, but he believes the clearing has been limited to the 300 feet.

Mr. Skalski commented he would prefer to see an 18 foot parking space encroaching over a green space rather than a 20 foot space with a bumper block.

Mr. Schley asked if the parking areas shown on the plan, based on rough estimates, are what the applicant really needs.

Mr. Milliken said the minimum required by Ordinance is 718, and they have satisfied that ordinance on the plan.

There being no further questions for Mr. Milliken, Chairperson Gelling turned the meeting over to the applicant.

Mr. Joe Gesmundo, 4200 W. Centre Ave., Portage MI, American Village Builders and LSC, thanked the Board and the Oshtemo Township staff for all the work they have put in regarding this project and the coordination with the MDOT project.

Mr. Gesmundo indicated the site plan and special use permit would be presented in two stages. The first is the overall vision for the 39 acres and the second is for the Costco site, which would be presented by Costco representatives. He noted the other people who would be speaking in the first stage were Tim Britten, Landscape Designer, Veritas Land Planning and Architecture; Todd Hurley, Civil Engineer with Hurley Stewart; Bob Rahl, RS Traffic Engineering Firm in Lansing; and Ron Kitchens of SW Michigan First.

Mr. Gesmundo said the vision for this project is “to create a gateway development with an exceptional collection of retail and services new to our region, uniquely designed buildings serving a broad geographic area.” It is understood this is a very important piece of property as a gateway to Oshtemo Township, W.M.U. and its business park, and the City of Kalamazoo. When the project is complete, he estimated conservatively it will develop 665 jobs, will be approximately 330,000 square feet with a capital investment of \$70,000,000 and will generate about \$1.5 million in property taxes. He provided a brief history of the project area and his involvement in purchasing the various properties over the last 22 years. He also described the collaboration to design, and the cooperative efforts with MDOT to provide, the attractive gateway they ultimately agreed upon rather than concrete walls that MDOT originally had planned to construct. He also explained that the collaboration yielded road widening for both lanes on the west side of the road only, by utilizing land from his parcel, rather than one lane from the east side. That will allow the provision for a trail system along Drake Road, the relocation of Century Avenue to the north for increased safety, development along Drake Road, and underground utilities. He concluded by saying he has been in the developing business in Kalamazoo County for 45 years and feels this is an incredible opportunity to do something truly great.

Mr. Tim Britten, Veritas Design Group, 313 N. Burdick Street, Kalamazoo, said his firm did a lot of the landscape planning and design for the project. He talked about existing conditions, explaining there is a depression in this area that was man made, probably created in a mining or borrowing operation early in the 1900s. The vegetation there is not old growth and it is likely that about 75-100 years ago the site was probably cleared for agriculture. He said this is not pristine, untouched land. He added that

because of those augmentations and because this is a commercial development it is impossible to keep some of the topography since a large flat area is needed. There needs to be a balance between commercial use and the existing conditions.

Mr. Britten described the improvements proposed along the access road, around the perimeter of the development, and at the gateway. The alignment of the meandering walkway as designed will help to blur the difference between public and private spaces along with the configuration of the extended wall. The walkway could easily be widened to 10 feet to provide a trail if the Township desires in the future, as part of the non-motorized plan.

Mr. Britten noted there will be about 2000 perennials and ornamental grasses around the wall that will be spectacular. There will be 440 trees around the perimeter in the first phase. Extrapolated to the out lot parcels, there will be 750 trees on the site, 2000 shrubs and 1000 perennials. The canopy will be mature in about 20 years and cover approximately 20 acres. He pointed out that in terms of the safety of the top of the retaining wall, if there is no walkable surface of the Township, landscaping can be used to block access. He said the service area will be landscaped to be secluded from the road, consistent with the vision that it will be a pedestrian friendly space balanced with auto space needs.

Mr. Todd Hurley, Civil Engineer with Hurley & Stewart Engineering, 2800 S. 11th Street, spoke to the Board next regarding stormwater and sanitary sewer. He said some stormwater would be discharged to the city system and other to MDOT. Costco stormwater would be accommodated on site. Between this project and the MDOT improvements, these projects will clean the area up from a stormwater standpoint. He added they would be connecting to the city water in three places and will put in a loop around the ring road for future connection for fire hydrants.

Mr. Hurley said the sanitary sewer was well thought through in the 1960s with plans to bring sewer into this site. Since that never happened it makes it easier to develop. The sanitary is sized to handle the whole 40 acres. A new eight inch line will handle all of the out lots and provision has been made for future connections.

Mr. Hurley said the Road Commission has approved the layout of the connection location to West Michigan and agreed that a left turn lane is not needed. He also answered questions that came up earlier in the meeting. To his knowledge the stakes indicating 300 feet in from the property line for clearing are still in place at the edge of the cleared area. Also, a couple of the wells have already been abandoned; wells are monitored by the State Health Department. Septic tanks are inspected by the County Health Department. The contractor is responsible to file all paperwork to trigger inspection.

Mr. Bob Rahl with RS Engineering, 915 Centennial Way in Lansing, MI spoke next. He said the responsibility of his firm was to look at the plans and make sure the traffic would work based on projections of expected traffic levels and what would need

to be accommodated on the site and in the surrounding roadway network. The Stadium and Drake intersection was a focus of study initially. Using standard traffic engineering they did a lot of trip generation and distributed the trips based on a traffic study from an actual Costco site. Adjustments were made for out lots and greater trip demand from Michigan Avenue, so the study reflects a conservative approach regarding the Michigan Avenue and New Century Avenue intersection. The study was vetted by MDOT, Kalamazoo County, City of Kalamazoo traffic engineers and Costco engineers. MDOT made a number of adjustments to their own design based on the work done by RS. He said they also did a follow up study regarding whether a left turn lane was warranted on Michigan Avenue. They found the volume would need to be seven times greater than the projected volume to warrant a left turn lane. Everyone agreed on the plan as presented as part of a collaborative process.

Mr. Ron Kitchens, Southwest Michigan First, thanked Mr. Gesmundo and his team as well as representatives of Costco. He said in 10 years this is the first retail project he has ever appeared about. SW Michigan First's focus is on primary employers bringing jobs into the county from outside the region rather than retail, but this project is different. As the region grows and new jobs and people move into the region there is a certain standard and economic culture people are looking for. Of those things, they are regularly asked if there is a Whole Foods, Trader Joe's and Costco. Those things we are being measured on, much like people talk about schools, hiking and biking trails, are critically important community assets.

Mr. Kitchens continued, saying the development is important beyond Costco. From a retail standpoint Costco is different as well. They are one of the best retail employers in terms of benefits and the way they treat their employees. They are fully committed to a living wage for their employees. These are jobs to be proud of. It is really important to grow the kinds of jobs people thrive on. He said our area has fairly mature business models based on 70's and 80's models. We're starting to see redevelopment, but this development is important because as we mature in our region, a lifestyle center becomes more and more important. Having a company come forward and build to future standards is very rare in today's market, and noted Mr. Gesmundo is devoted to quality long-term development. He believes the greatest force for change is well-paying jobs. They are critically important and recruiting new companies to build to our new expectations will result in more jobs. We will grow more jobs in the region because of this \$70,000,000 investment in the community. He concluded by saying he is grateful for visionary leaders and a company that has hundreds of communities knocking at their door having chosen us.

Mr. Ted Johnson, Design Strategies, 2311 W. 22nd Street in Oak Brook spoke next. He is Costco's authorized agent and Development Director for Midwest Projects. He explained Costco is a members only warehouse club and pointed out the nearest Costco is in Grand Rapids/Wyoming MI. He described key details about the company.

Mr. Johnson said since Mr. Milliken had done such a good job of explaining their plan he would go through it very quickly. He briefly reviewed the site plan, which

includes the warehouse, a four station fueling facility that provides only regular or premium gas, and parking. He noted, regarding the landscape plan, that although they were initially short on interior landscaping they had updated the plan and now meet the Township requirements so they will not need to seek a variance.

Mr. Johnson said that with respect to the wall and landscaping along West Michigan Avenue the building codes wouldn't require a barrier since there isn't a walkway, but Costco puts up a barrier with a two foot setback from the curb when there is a wall with landscaping on either side so no cars can go over the wall. Parking is provided for roughly 150,000 square feet, they attempt to get just shy of 5 per 1000 feet. Required for this project is 719 spaces; Costco will provide 724.

Mr. Johnson addressed lighting, saying that in the winter Costco stays open until 8:30, but the warehouse is open for clean up until about 11:00 p.m. and at that point only the down lights that light the walls are on and the pumps at the fueling facility are lit enough for security. There are 200 skylights at the top of the warehouse to provide light to the building on sunny days.

Mr. Johnson said they do four sided architecture with interest on all sides. The roof height and parapets are varied and the same stack stone that Mr. Gesmundo wants to use throughout the development will be used on the warehouse building. The fueling facility is a canopy over pumps with an 8 x 8 x 12 foot enclosure for the safety monitors monitoring the facility. Three sides are screened; the side facing the pumps has signage and buttons that need to be accessible. He added there is only one entrance/exit point at all Costco warehouses for customers. The building has a masonry base, a middle of textured metal or rib paneled and a cornice on the top of the building.

Mr. Johnson concluded by thanking the Board for allowing him to present his proposal and commented that Costco is looking forward to becoming part of the community here. He said he would be happy to answer any questions.

Chairperson Gelling noted there are four different square footages listed in various places in the proposal and asked which was correct.

Mr. Johnson said there are variables regarding how the Township may count different parts of the development, which is made up of the main warehouse, the canopy, parking and a pump room if required. The prototype is 150,000 square feet.

Mr. Schley asked what assumptions were made regarding the corner of 11th Street and West Michigan and the need for a left turn lane when the traffic study was done.

Mr. Rahl said they based the study on what is there today and did traffic projections 20 years into the future based on information from the Metropolitan Planning Organization. It was an extensive process. They did not consider any new development

beyond what is proposed here, so they did not look at the corner of 11th Street and West Michigan; they were bound by this particular development.

Mr. Schley asked if a light at Drake Road is guaranteed.

Mr. Rahl said that was part of the study and MDOT is committed to placing a new light at New Century and Drake Rd. The City and County have both agreed with their assessment that it is warranted.

Mr. Milliken said the City of Kalamazoo approved the proposal based on the layout that included the light and lane configuration as shown on the plan.

Mr. Loy commented it would make sense to add a left turn lane for safety. A lot of people will bypass Drake Road and go in via West Michigan Avenue. He said it would be a simple fix and would make sense.

Mr. Rahl said the plan goes by the traffic engineering guidelines that say 250 vehicles can be accommodated in both directions at peak hours. He said they tried to over-project because they understand his point and tried to account for that. It would take seven times more left turning traffic to warrant a left turn lane.

Mr. Skalski said this is a fantastic project. He appreciated the completeness and thoroughness of the supporting materials. He said he loves the gateway and the fact that the architectural materials tie in with the retaining walls. He asked if Michigan Avenue would be rebuilt along that stretch; his concern was the non-motorized character.

Mr. Rahl said they were providing a four foot paved shoulder for walkers and an additional four feet of gravel to allow a stalled vehicle to pull over. He said they are still talking with the Road Commission about the other side of the road but that it will likely be the same.

Mr. Skalski asked about left turns for residents of the apartment complex on Drake Road north of K-Mart.

Mr. Rahl replied there had not been a lot of discussion with the land owner, but it is believed the traffic light will create gaps so there will be more much opportunity than currently to make left turns from the complex.

Chairperson Gelling asked for clarification about the service drive.

Mr. Gesmundo said the roadways are private and will be maintained by the property owners association.

Attorney Porter noted the Township must be assured that the service drive will be maintained and that will be addressed in the easement language for the drive.

Mr. Johnson explained Costco wants to be sure the service drive is maintained and plowed and that they will not wait for the association, but will do that work themselves and will bill the association afterwards. He also said they would be responsible for storm retention that will be on the Costco property and that both of those items will be addressed in writing. He also commented that when he first started the project's due diligence phase he was very concerned about traffic. Costco wants to be sure there is easy in and out for their members. They had their traffic firm review the study and sit in on the collaborative meetings on traffic issues, and Costco is very comfortable with the final design.

Chairperson Gelling asked why trees were clear cut for this project when they weren't for the Woodbridge Hills project.

Mr. Gesmundo said the land for the Woodbridge Hills project was already 90% flat so that some big trees could be saved. 70% of the land for this project is too steep for any development and had to be graded to be used so they are unable to save trees. They are mitigating their removal with more than 700 trees that will be planted.

Mr. Boulding Sr. asked for clarification on why the retention pond, which is close to an apartment complex, will not be fenced.

Mr. Hurley explained the working depth is seven feet for a 100 year storm, and in that situation it would be seven feet deep for only a couple of days. Most of the time it will percolate well through gravel and sand and will be fairly dry especially with the water pre-treatment that will remove oils and sediment before it goes to the pond. It is landscaped and protected and he commented that fences cause other problems.

Mr. Schley said the architecture is quite attractive but he wondered if compatible treatment could be provided on the gas pump kiosk to make it more attractive.

Mr. Johnson said that could be done and that Mr. Milliken would be provided with a plan to do that within the week.

Hearing no further questions from Commissioners, Chairperson Gelling opened the meeting to public comments.

Ms. Kathleen Garland-Ryke, 6180 Ashwood Court, and a former Planning Commission member, commented she is happy Costco is being considered for location here, but had three concerns: 1) the loss of natural features – she'd like to see some berming to give a rolling feel consistent with the character of the Township, and would like native plants to be considered for inclusion to soften the 12 foot stone feature, 2) she would like to see a more uniform application of ordinances; 3) she'd like to see the item tabled for a month until the Zoning Board of Appeals meets to allow input from all involved agencies.

Attorney Porter pointed out that the issue of natural features was considered and he cautioned the Commission to follow their Ordinance. If they try to impose conditions, the Ordinance must support them.

Mr. Milliken noted that a few emails regarding this application were received and had been provided to Planning Commissioners.

Hearing no further public comment, Chairperson Gelling moved to Board Deliberations.

Mr. Schley said he is in support of this project. He said he would like to see natural features preserved, but is aware there are severe site constraints. The current site is a mess. The broader vision includes what is around it to the east. He is hopeful this will spur changes across the street to enrich the broader community. The additional jobs are a positive. He is glad to hear that Costco will put in a barrier for any walls over 36" high. Although it is not a part of this request, he said he is not in favor of the 11 foot bufferyard variance that will be before the ZBA. He noted he believes another variance will be needed from the ZBA for the parking spaces as defined by ordinance. He concluded by saying this is a nice project and we are lucky to have it.

Mr. Loy said this is an awesome project and will be a welcome addition to our community. They have done an excellent job on the landscaping. He looks forward to the new jobs and agrees with the design work modification to the pump building.

Mr. Boulding Sr. said he is glad to see this project move along. He is most pleased the development will provide well-paying jobs, and his hat is off to Costco. He said the project looks great and that the new trees going in will compensate adequately for those that are lost. He said Costco will be a great addition to the community and is in total agreement with moving forward.

Mr. Skalski agreed with everything previously said, is excited about the gateway improvements, and hopes that can be replicated at the other three corners. He likes the meandering trailway, thinks it is a fantastic development and believes he can already see related outcomes; one example is that the old K-Mart store is being re-developed.

Chairperson Gelling said she is totally and completely for this project and thinks it is a huge enhancement to the community. She said we are grateful and honored to have such a wonderful development coming in. It shows the community is thriving and property values will be enhanced. She said she knows a lot of work has been put into this project and has trust that Costco, the Planning Department and Oshtemo Township will put it all together to make it perfect. She said she's very grateful and can't thank Costco enough for considering Oshtemo Township as a site and thanked Mr. Gesmundo for all he has done and is doing and thanked everyone for their involvement.

Mr. Antosz was concerned about the terrain and loss of trees, but understands they are trying their best to make it very nice. He acknowledged Costco for

accommodating requests in order to meet the Township Ordinance. He said it will be great for Oshtemo to have Costco in the community.

Ms. Farmer said she had many questions coming into the meeting but they were all answered. She said she appreciated Mr. Gesmundo and Costco for working with the Township to meet their needs and is in support of the project, but asked Mr. Gesmundo if there could be some sort of rolling feature incorporated in the landscaping, as suggested by the resident who spoke.

Mr. Gesmundo responded he thinks she is talking about a curvilinear fashioned trail and explained that as the trail is planned, it is undulating and believes it does what was suggested.

Hearing no further comments, Chairperson Gelling asked for two motions regarding the special exception use and site plan.

Mr. Skalski made a motion to approve the special exception request from Costco Wholesale Corporation for a 149,505 square foot retail store with a free-standing, accessory fuel station. Ms. Farmer seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

Mr. Schley made a motion to approve the request for site plan approval from Costco Wholesale Corporation for development of a new 150,000 square foot retail store with a gas station on 16.29 acres within a new 39.25 acre commercial development at the northwest corner of Stadium Drive and Drake Road with the following conditions:

1. The parcels are combined and reconfigured consistent with the proposed plan in compliance with State and Township regulations and approved legal descriptions provided.
2. Confirmation of approval from the Kalamazoo County Road Commission for the vacation of Century Drive and Highfield Street and a driveway permit for the access point onto West Michigan Avenue.
3. Coordination between the developer, Road Commission, and Township regarding the evaluation of potential traffic impacts to West Michigan Avenue as a result of the proposed development and appropriate mitigation strategies and the subsequent implementation of said strategies.
4. Easement language for the proposed service drive be reviewed and approved by the Township Attorney prior to recording and a recorded copy provided to the Township.
5. Compliance with the requirements of the City of Kalamazoo and MDOT for improvements to Drake Road and the proposed access point on Drake Road.

6. Provision of an easement for areas in which the meandering sidewalk along Drake Road extends beyond the right of way.
7. Variance approval from the Zoning Board of Appeals for the location of the loading zone in the front yard, the location of parking in the bufferyard area, and the use of lamps in excess of 400 watts. If variances are not approved, these elements shall be brought into conformance with Ordinance requirements.
8. Streetlights along the entry drive shall be consistent with the information presented on the plans and satisfy the requirements of the Ordinance.
9. The Landscape Plan for Costco will need to be amended or a variance obtained in regards to the amount of parking lot landscape area as well as the number of trees within that area.
10. A sign permit is required for any signage that may be erected on the site.
11. Site plan approval is subject to approval of the Fire Department, pursuant to adopted codes.
12. Site plan approval is subject to review and approval of the Township Engineer and compliance with specific requirements as provided for in his review, as appropriate.
13. The site plan shall be amended such that the parking spaces conform to the required square footage or a variance granted.

Mr. Loy seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

Chairperson Gelling thanked all those who attended for their participation.

Any Other Business

Chairperson Gelling asked if anyone had other business to discuss.

Mr. Milliken noted that this was Chairperson Gelling's last meeting after completing two 3-year terms. Mr. Milliken thanked her for six years of dedicated service and her leadership as Chair.

Mr. Milliken noted a new Planning Commission member has not yet been appointed so there will likely be only six Commissioners at the first January meeting. He noted there will be a leadership change at that meeting and asked members to think about a Chair and Vice Chair.

Planning Commissioner Comments

The Chairperson asked if Commissioners had comments to share.

Ms. Farmer said it had been a pleasure to work with Ms. Gelling over the last year and was glad to have the opportunity.

Mr. Antosz congratulated the Parks Committee and Karen High on the approval of the second \$300,000 grant for Phase Two work at Flesher Field.

Mr. Skalski noted he had enjoyed working with Chairperson Gelling who led the organization well by defining goals and limits. He added it was a pleasure to work with Costco; the way they put their project together to match the character of the area and the materials assembled are how he envisions projects.

Mr. Boulding Sr. said he appreciated Ms. Gelling's style and leadership. He said he has memories he will carry for a long time.

Mr. Loy said the three years he has served with Ms. Gelling have been great and he hopes he'll have the opportunity to work with her again. He commented on the Costco development saying we have not had a development of this nature or size since he's been on the Planning Commission. He said staff had done a tremendous job working with the state and various entities.

Mr. Schley thanked Kitty for a job well done. It is good to see the Commission work the way it needs to work, even in challenging situations.

Chairperson Gelling said she had enjoyed her time on the Board and thanked everyone for their good wishes.

Adjournment

Having exhausted the agenda, and with there being no further business to discuss, Chairperson Gelling adjourned the Planning Commission meeting at approximately 11:14 p.m.

Minutes prepared:
December 18, 2013

Minutes approved:
January 9, 2013